




Original citation: Rooney, Joy  (2020) *Compassion in mental health: a literature review*. Mental Health and Social Inclusion. ISSN Print: 2042-8308, Online: 2042-8316 (In Press)

Permanent WRaP URL: <https://eprints.worc.ac.uk/id/eprint/9461>

Copyright and reuse:

The Worcester Research and Publications (WRaP) makes this work available open access under the following conditions. Copyright © and all moral rights to the version of the paper presented here belong to the individual author(s) and/or other copyright owners. To the extent reasonable and practicable the material made available in WRaP has been checked for eligibility before being made available.

Copies of full items can be used for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes without prior permission or charge, provided that the authors, title and full bibliographic details are credited, a hyperlink and/or URL is given for the original metadata page and the content is not changed in any way.

Publisher's statement:

This is an Accepted Manuscript of an article published by Emerald Publishing on 30 June 2020, available online at <https://doi.org/10.1108/MHSI-05-2020-0029>

This accepted manuscript is deposited under the Creative Commons Attribution Non-commercial International Licence 4.0 ([CC-BY-NC 4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/)) To reuse the accepted manuscript for commercial purposes, permission should be sought by contacting permissions@emeraldinsight.com

A note on versions:

The version presented here may differ from the published version or, version of record, if you wish to cite this item you are advised to consult the publisher's version. Please see the 'permanent WRaP URL' above for details on accessing the published version and note that access may require a subscription.

For more information, please contact wrapteam@worc.ac.uk



Compassion in mental health: a literature review

Journal:	<i>Mental Health and Social Inclusion</i>
Manuscript ID	MHSI-05-2020-0029
Manuscript Type:	Literature Review
Keywords:	compassion, self-compassion, mental health, biomedical model, service users and carers

SCHOLARONE™
Manuscripts

Compassion in mental health: a literature review

Abstract

Purpose: To systematically review the current literature on compassion in mental health from a historical, service user and carer (SUAC)/academic researcher perspective with respect to the current paradigm/biomedical model.

Methodology: Searches were conducted in CIANHL Complete, Academic Search Complete, British Education Index, ERIC, MEDLINE, PsycArticles, Scopus, Proquest Central using a simplified PRISM approach.

Findings: In the UK, the SUAC-movement facilitated the adoption of more compassionate mental health in statutory services. Across the world, compassion-based approaches may be viewed as beneficial, especially to those experiencing a biomedical model 'treatment'. Healthcare workers, suffering burnout and fatigue during neoliberal economics, benefit from compassion training, both in their practice and personally. Randomised control trials (RCTs) demonstrate compassion-type interventions are effective, given sufficient intervention timing, duration, and design methodology. Psychology creates outcome measures of adequacies and deficiencies in compassion, demonstrating their importance statistically, with reservations. The effective protection of mental health by self-compassion in both SUACs and health care professionals is evident. It is clear from qualitative research that SUACs prefer compassionate mental health. It also makes a large difference to mental health in general populations. Implications for practice and suggestions for future research are given, including a necessity to fund RCTs comparing compassionate mental health interventions with the biomedical model. Unless statutory mental health services adopt this emerging evidence base, medics and their SUACs will continue to rely on pharmaceuticals.

Originality/value: This is the first integrated literature review of compassion in mental health from a historical, SUAC/academic researcher viewpoint using all research methodologies.

Keywords: compassion, self-compassion, mental health, biomedical model, service users and carers

Paper type: Literature review

Introduction

Compassion in mental health care is widely recognised as a necessity for those delivering and receiving support due to troubled lives.

However, service users and carers (SUACs), their families, friends and healthcare professional allies are unhappy that compassion may be disappearing in statutory healthcare systems internationally, possibly due to the current paradigm of using a biomedical model of professionally, detached healthcare workers and neoliberal economics.

Compassion across all healthcare disciplines needs to be distinguished from compassion in mental health within these disciplines. Clearly, a notion of compassion is embedded in an early evidence base, arising from spirituality - that compassion is an act of doing something to alleviate troubles in contrast to empathy, sympathy and feeling something for the person in trouble.

Compassion may be directed towards others or oneself. The evidence base for self-compassion is increasingly being defined as including kindness to oneself, being non-judgemental of oneself, common humanity rather than isolation and mindfulness rather than over-identification. It is having kind and warm attitudes toward oneself when one encounters difficulties, failures, or suffering (Neff, 2003).

In psychology, compassion fatigue, compassion stress, compassion satisfaction and secondary posttraumatic stress disorder were first recognised by Figley (1995) as those facets of caring for service users which may appear in mental health professionals. Psychologists have designed many questionnaire measures which include Likert scales that are standardised to define and distinguish these lexicons resulting in a multitude of semi-quantitative, multivariate analysed published studies of outcomes.

The paradigm of a biomedical model of mental health is becoming more widely questioned by mental health professionals and service users and carers, most recently in an alternative - power, threat, meaning framework (PTMF; Johnstone and Boyle, 2018). There are no biological aberrations linked to psychiatric diagnoses (for example, in a physical scenario: comparing insulin deficiency in diabetes). Neither are there currently simple biomarkers in human genomes that suggest psychiatric diagnoses or biomedical body parts being involved (Johnstone and

Boyle, 2018). People experience troubles, not biology, and troubles lead to mental distress (Johnstone, 2019).

There is gathering momentum from SUAC organisations and their health and social care professional allies for another route to wellbeing, for example, Compassionate Mental Health (2020), Mad in America (Whitaker, 2010), Mad Studies (Menziés *et al.*, 2013; Russo and Sweeny, 2016; Spandler and Poursanidou, 2019). The notion of human compassion holds an enormous evidence base; this review is confined to those studies which include mental health affecting students, populations, SUACs and healthcare professionals where compassion is measured by a defined methodology.

Methodology

A simplified PRISM approach was employed: an initial literature search used the search terms “compassionate mental health” together in CIANHL Complete, Academic Search Complete, ERIC, MEDLINE, PsycArticles, Scopus, Proquest Central with no restrictions and produced 17 relevant articles.

These databases were revisited using broader literature search terms: “compassion” AND “mental health” which generated >7,600 hits; thus these terms were filtered to be included in title only, adding: AND NOT “young adult” OR “young person” OR adolescent OR juvenile OR child* across all whole articles; there were 53 further relevant articles. Reference list and citation searches produced a further 41 articles.

Inclusion and exclusion criteria/ quality assessment

Case studies and studies with fewer than nine participants were excluded. During the first search, six were omitted as the search-phrase was used with no definition. During the second, eight were omitted because of sampling methodology and drop-out rates.

Findings

A historical perspective is presented, initially in the UK, also including some of the drivers for change: poor quality care resulting in new policy, education and outcomes in practice; then internationally, and where possible, information with greater reliability is presented first (randomised control trials- RCTs,.) next semi-quantitative (psychology

1
2
3 generated Likert scales outcome measures), and lastly qualitative
4 evidence.
5

6 *UK origins and early works*

7
8
9 Brown *et al.* (2014) cite Valera (1992) as maybe a recent starting point
10 for compassion philosophy. Certainly, grassroots activists were evident
11 during 2005, when Paul Farmer, then of the Mental Health Alliance, was
12 cited by Parish (2005) as campaigning about deficiency of
13 compassionate mental health in statutory mental health services.
14
15

16
17 Gilbert first published his ideas on teaching compassion (Gilbert and
18 Procter, 2006), later developing this into a compassion-based
19 psychotherapy (Gilbert, 2010). This is still widely practised as
20 compassion focused therapy (CFT) by trained psychologists, sometimes
21 within NHS Trusts. Gilbert (2010) went on to describe the relationships
22 between different forms of compassion and fear in undergraduate
23 psychology plus forensic science students (N=222) and therapists
24 (N=53) because in therapy he discovered some clients were not able to
25 respond to CFT. Fear of compassion for self was linked to fear of
26 compassion from others; thus, difficulties with therapeutic interventions
27 and the therapeutic relationship were explainable.
28
29
30
31
32

33 *UK increasing momentum – compassion in mental health care*

34
35 SUACs, grassroots activists, third sector organisations and healthcare
36 professional allies are all able to influence policy and practice
37 encouraging compassionate mental health. The Blair legacy for mental
38 health reform of statutory services was discussed by Allen (2007); he
39 cited a Mental Health Network of the NHS Confederation document:
40 Time and Trouble: towards proper and compassionate mental health
41 care (2007). During this time, the King's Fund ran a series of workshops
42 the findings of which were published (Firth-Cozens and Cornwell, 2009)
43 about compassionate care in acute settings (not necessarily mental
44 health).
45
46
47
48
49

50
51 Shea and Lionis (2010) cite a 2009 Department of Health NHS
52 Constitution report including a call for compassionate action, now
53 updated with six mentions in the 2015 NHS Constitution. The Oxford
54 Handbook of Compassion Science (2017) contains a Shea and Lionis
55 chapter (2017: pp 457-474) calling for compassion in healthcare.
56
57

58
59 A further Department of Health (2012) Chief Nursing Officer's
60 consultation document was published by The King's Fund (2012) on the

1
2
3 six C's including 'developing a culture of compassionate healthcare'.
4 While in 2014, Dewar *et al.* (2014) clarified misconceptions about
5 compassionate care in a discussion article, including citing the atrocities
6 of Winterbourne View and the South Staffordshire NHS Trust debacle.
7 For nursing, their findings should:
8
9

10
11 "...be used across policy, practice and education to raise awareness of
12 beliefs and values that underpin the meaning of compassionate care.
13

14 ...provide a foundation on which to establish a shared vision for
15 compassionate caring in health and social care that has relevance to the
16 realities of practice." Dewar *et al.* (2014: pp. 1739).
17
18

19
20 *UK education to undergraduates and mental health professional in*
21 *compassion*
22

23 From 2010, Shea and Lionis, take up the gauntlet for teaching
24 compassionate healthcare, providing a historic overview and application
25 in rural settings across the world (Shea and Lionis, 2010).
26
27

28 The Scottish Leadership in Compassionate Care Programme, (Adamson
29 and Dewar, 2015) further described how action research in practice was
30 used to educate a group of 37 third year undergraduate nursing students
31 through stories and reflections, at least benefitting the 16 who posted
32 feedback about their increased compassionate care. They all thought
33 that the knowledge, skills and confidence gained would result in a
34 development of compassionate relationship centred care within future
35 practice (Adamson and Dewar, 2015).
36
37
38
39

40 Further, education of clinicians and trainees weak in compassion is
41 outlined in a model that benefits clinicians, patients, trainees and
42 institutions through four steps – detached care, detached empathy,
43 affective empathy and compassionated care (Post *et al.*, 2014). It also
44 suggests future development of a compassion scale and that
45 'detachment' is not to be idealised.
46
47
48
49

50 For social work students (n=87) self-compassion, assessed via a
51 simplified, 12 question, five-point Likert scale, significantly inversely
52 affected stress, anxiety and depression in multiple regression analysis
53 (Kotera, et al., 2019). Thus, these authors recommend further education
54 in self-compassion during social work undergraduate and postgraduate
55 study in Higher Education, and research to assess its impact.
56
57
58
59

60 *UK outcome comparisons in practice*

SUACs

A consideration of the relationship between a “recovery model” and compassionate care by Spandler and Stickley (2011) including service user perspectives and current policy, concluded that compassionate acceptance of the uniqueness of ‘recovery’ for all those with troubles is necessary together with compassionate relationships and contexts to foster hope, a central tenet of recovery.

Five focus groups of SUACs (n=30) were consulted regarding their views on compassion during mental health care (Lloyd and Carson, 2011). Three themes emerged: universality, diversity and recovery. Possible means to measure compassion was by comparing staff as: presence with absence; collaboration with oppression and persistence with resistance (Lloyd and Carson, 2011).

The only third sector organisation represented is MIND (McAndrew et al., 2017). From a small sample of mental health services users (n=12) themes established from individual interviews: mindful of the gap; easing like Sunday morning; magic moments; love is in the air; lighting-up a future and changing the status quod. These themes demonstrated that SUACs preferred MIND counselling to statutory services with respect the means of delivery of compassionate mental health.

Within an NHS setting, Cogan et al. (2017) implemented a “mindful path to compassion” intervention to an adult group (n=20). These researchers demonstrated significantly improved outcome measures and qualitative feedback had high levels of satisfaction experienced by those people, assessed to hold several clinically associated troubles.

Military veterans (n=10) associated with Scottish mental health clinics believed that compassion is an important quality of peer support workers, particularly in the persistence in gaining veterans’ engagement (Weir et al. 2019)

Mental health professionals’ delivery of compassion

Language used in interviews of acute mental healthcare staff (n=20) demonstrated a use of “production-line”, task orientated ideas rather than those of compassion, especially as interview questions were centred around compassion; language used included: time pressures, care processes, and organizational tensions undermining best practice Crawford et al. (2013).

1
2
3 While Barron *et al.* (2017) suggested that even following policy and
4 scandal reports, it continued to be difficult for a small number (n=9) of
5 experienced community psychiatric nurses in Scotland to always deliver
6 compassionate mental health with the pressures of NHS task-orientated
7 systems. They recommended supervision, mindfulness, and self-
8 compassion as solutions, together with further consideration of what
9 compassion means in practice in the workplace.
10
11
12
13

14 A review of 32 articles which described compassion fatigue within a
15 range of mental health professionals suggested such factors as trauma
16 history of mental health professionals and empathy were ameliorated by
17 certain behavioural and cognitive coping styles and mindfulness
18 (Turgoose and Maddox, 2017).
19
20
21

22 Towey-Swift and Whittington (2019) using questionnaires and a number
23 of Likert scale measures with professionally qualified staff (n=217;
24 response rate = 61%) within community mental health teams of three
25 NHS Trusts demonstrated that compassion fatigue and compassion
26 satisfaction were statistically significantly linked to workload as a
27 professional quality of life indicator. Workload is unlikely to be
28 significantly reduced within the NHS, however, approaches aiming to
29 streamline workload burden, together with interventions targeting
30 perceived reward and values need to be considered by managers and
31 further studied.
32
33
34
35
36

37 Donald *et al.* (2019) demonstrated a training course developed to
38 convey compassion-based care with hospital mental health staff, during
39 times of economic pressure, was transformative according to a
40 qualitative study of participant's views (n=12).
41
42
43

44 *Development of Compassionate Mental Health across the world*

45 There is also the notion of compassion stress in healthcare
46 professionals, particularly in social workers, first identified by Figley
47 (1995) and readdressed by Radey and Figley (2007). The model they
48 created suggested increasing positive effect by keeping a positive
49 attitude to people, increasing resources to manage stress and increasing
50 self-care by finding inspiration and happiness in life.
51
52
53
54

55 *Randomised Control Trials (RCTs)*

56
57 Systematic reviews and meta-analyses of RCTs in relation to
58 compassion delivering-type interventions demonstrated that compassion
59 and self-compassion highly significantly increased. While fear of self-
60

1
2
3 compassion, psychopathology, for example, anxiety, depression, and
4 stress decreased, often also highly significantly (MacBeth and Gumley
5 2012, Kirby et al. 2017, Ferrari et al. 2019; Lombas, 2019). Where
6 measured, such changes were maintained even after 6 months.
7
8

9
10 Not included in the above was a RCT of Compassion Focused Therapy
11 (CFT) resulted in a sustained transformation in 3, 9 and 12-month follow-
12 ups in an adult population (n=120) in the Netherlands, compared with
13 those remaining on a waiting list (n=122; Sommers-Spijkerman et al.,
14 2018). Thus, CFT as guided self-help showed promise as a public
15 mental health strategy for enhancing well-being and reducing
16 psychological distress.
17
18

19
20 In addition, a RCT of mainly mental health social workers (n=63), in
21 USA, demonstrated that guided imagery versus taking a break, reduced
22 compassion fatigue through increased sleep quality and decreased
23 anxiety (Kiley et al., 2018).
24
25

26
27 Most recently, Kirby and Gilbert (2019) critiqued Wilson et al. (2019)
28 meta-analysis of the efficacy of self-compassion type therapies,
29 suggesting their inclusion criteria were not critical enough.
30
31

32
33
34 *Psychology measures of aspects of compassion in mental health –*
35 *both SUACs and healthcare workers*
36

37
38 Rossi et al. (2012) provided quantitative evidence from a questionnaire
39 (n=250; 84% response rate) of Italian community mental healthcare
40 professionals in Verona, of compassion satisfaction – lacking due to
41 psychological distress and compassion fatigue more in social workers
42 and psychiatrists based on five-point Likert scales. Compassion fatigue
43 was higher in women, those with all those of longer service year by year
44 and those with adverse life events in the previous year (Rossi, et al.,
45 2012).
46
47

48
49 Ray et al. (203) extended these findings to Canadian frontline mental
50 healthcare staff (n=169) to include six areas of work (workload, control,
51 reward, community, values and fairness); higher levels of compassion
52 satisfaction, lower levels of compassion fatigue, and higher overall
53 degree of fit in the six areas of work life reduced burnout (Ray, et al.,
54 2013).
55
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 Some mental health counsellors in USA suffer compassion fatigue; this
4 was predicted by working conditions, mindfulness, use of coping
5 strategies and compassion satisfaction through a significant 31% of
6 variance in multiple regression analysis (n= 213; Thompson et al., 2014).
7
8

9
10 More recently in the South African Cape, Abrahams and Gevers (2017),
11 cited compassion fatigue by providers of mental health services
12 negatively affecting the work of their staff. They recommend debriefing,
13 support, understanding the need for self-care, as staff are reported to
14 become protective, detached and distress-intolerant of cases of rape.
15
16

17
18 While surveying general nurses (n=235), a study in Taiwan, Chu (2017),
19 found they self-assessed as moderate for compassion, interpersonal
20 relationship quality and job performance over-all, on a six-point Likert
21 scale. Providing compassion was significantly positively correlated with
22 interpersonal relationship quality, job performance and mental health.
23 Thus, Chu (2017; 464) concluded that nurses who often provided
24 compassion to suffering colleagues have enhanced job performance and
25 improved mental health. Creating high-quality interpersonal relationships
26 in the workplace can effectively strengthen the positive benefits of
27 providing compassion for both job performance and mental health.
28
29
30
31

32
33 A large Italian survey (n=400; response rate 87%), including
34 psychiatrists, psychiatrists in training, psychologists, social workers,
35 psychiatric nurses, educators, rehabilitation therapists, and healthcare
36 support workers, across three similar areas. Interacting factors,
37 including compassion fatigue and satisfaction were analysed with
38 multiple regression statistics from a 30 question, five-item Likert scale
39 Italian Life Scale questionnaire (Cetrano et al., 2017). Ergonomic
40 problems (especially time pressures) and impact of work on life
41 predicted: higher levels of compassion fatigue; perceived quality of
42 meetings; need of training. Compassion satisfaction was affected by
43 future job insecurities.
44
45
46
47
48

49
50 Samios (2018) demonstrated, for a combination of mental health social
51 workers, psychologist and counsellors in rural western Australia (n=69),
52 compassion satisfaction partially mediated the relationship between
53 mindfulness and depression, and fully mediated the relationships
54 between mindfulness and the positive indicators of adjustment (i.e.,
55 positive affect and life satisfaction). The outcome of this study supported
56 the incorporation of mindfulness-based strategies into rural mental
57 health professionals' self-care.
58
59
60

1
2
3 La Mott and Martin (2019) demonstrated that for USA licenced mental
4 healthcare providers (individuals; n=371), there were greater negative
5 compassion outcomes of those that suffered adverse childhood
6 experiences (ACE) compare with those who did not have such a history.
7 Because self-care and compassion satisfaction were significantly
8 statistically linked, it was suggested that training in self-care is
9 necessary for those experiencing ACE.
10
11
12
13

14 Varghese (2020) demonstrated from American Psychiatric Nurses
15 Association active nurses (n=xxx), that those with high levels of positive
16 attributes of self-compassion had higher perceived levels of caring
17 efficacy and those with high levels of negative attributes of self-
18 compassion had lower perceived levels of caring efficacy. Therefore, a
19 knowledge of the association between attributes of self-compassion and
20 perceived caring efficacy will provide nurses with improved awareness of
21 the need to be compassionate to the self and its relationship to
22 effectiveness of care provided, potentially leading to positive health
23 outcomes in clients. There was no significant ameliorating effect, for
24 example, length in role, nurse patient ratio and perceived level of caring
25 efficacy.
26
27
28
29
30
31

32 In those individuals with mental distress (n=13), a CFT intervention
33 compared with controls (n=7) resulted in significantly increased self-
34 compassion, and reduced depression, anxiety, stress and rumination
35 (Frostadottir and Dorjee, 2019).
36
37
38

39 In inpatient units, a mindfulness self-compassion (MSC) intervention on
40 those people suffering mental distress, without acute psychosis (n=139)
41 was compared with a control of progressive muscle relaxation. Self-
42 compassion significantly increased as did happiness with MSC as
43 assessed five weeks later; mental health increased similarly in both
44 study groups (Gaiswinkler et al (2019)).
45
46
47

48 *Qualitative evidence for SUACs*

49

50 Academics in the USA (Iwasaki and Byrd, 2010), used focus groups to
51 demonstrate that urban American Indians (n=25) believed that Indian
52 doctors gave greater compassionate mental health care recognising
53 their cultural identities.
54
55

56 More recently, Horsfall et al. (2018) consulted people with mental
57 distress (n=24) during a year of study of their recovery. These
58 researchers were able to identify a fourth theme, of having a
59
60

1
2
3 compassionate service provision, provided by those people with lived
4 experience.
5

6 *Self-compassion in all populations*

7
8
9 Ying (2009) in USA social work students (n=65) demonstrated that a
10 negative component of self-compassion: over-identification, directly and
11 indirectly (as mediated by decreased coherence, ie. competence)
12 affected depressive symptom level.
13
14

15 In the Netherlands, Trompetter et al. (2017) demonstrated, for university
16 student recruited public (n=349), self-compassion is significantly linked
17 to positive mental health and inversely to psychopathology. It was
18 speculated that self-compassion is a resilience mechanism and adaptive
19 emotion regulation strategy.
20
21
22

23 Self-compassion in older Korean adults was statistically demonstrated to
24 reduce depression, sleep disturbance and increase health related quality
25 of life (Kim and Ho, 2018).
26
27

28 Self-compassion was further studied in USA college students (n=500;
29 Berryhill et al., 2018). Positive communication within families was
30 related to higher levels of self-compassion, and that higher levels of self-
31 compassion were related to lower levels of depression and anxiety.
32 Positive communication and self-compassion mediated the relationship
33 between cohesive flexible family functioning and anxiety and depression
34 (Berryhill et al., 2018).
35
36
37
38

39 Emotional regulation may be a means of accepting self-compassion if
40 individuals learn to be present with their distress, reducing the need for
41 maladaptive strategies. This finding was from an Australian review of
42 five selected articles (Inwood and Ferrari, 2018). Explicitly cultivating
43 self-compassion may be a beneficial treatment target for many mental
44 health disorders.
45
46
47

48 A Turkish study of questionnaires generated from a general population,
49 also involving researchers from the Netherlands (Yakin et al., 2019;
50 n=296) demonstrated that when early years emotional needs are not
51 met then self-compassion and negative emotion regulation represent
52 complementary concepts, each playing a unique role in different aspects
53 of mental health.
54
55
56

57 Potentially morally injurious experiences were ameliorated by the level of
58 self-compassion in USA military veterans (n=203) as assessed by a
59
60

1
2
3 questionnaire (Forkus, et al., 2019). These authors suggested that
4 research needs to be carried out on benefits of using self-compassion as
5 a clinical intervention for PTSD, self-harm, and depression symptoms.
6
7

8 **Discussion**

9

10 While much literature is present about compassion in mental health, this
11 may be the first recent synthesis across all healthcare professions that
12 includes RCTs, semi-quantitative questionnaire outcome measures and
13 qualitative reports from interview and focus group thematic analyses;
14 space precludes discussion of the merits and limitations of each.
15
16
17

18 Taken together this literature demonstrates the human psyche has
19 difficulty fitting into neoliberal economies of more recent times. Although
20 there are no studies which explicitly make such comparisons. Neither
21 are there studies, yet published, in which RCTs compare a biomedical
22 model implementation of diagnoses and pathology with any other
23 compassion-based therapies. The only evidence are qualitative studies
24 of the service user voice (Lloyd and Carlson, 211; Cogan 2017;
25 McAndrew et al., 2017). However, there is a RCT in progress as part of
26 a UK Open Dialogue (OD), ODESSI initiative, where networks of people
27 around a person in trouble are supported by mental health professionals
28 using an equal power platform (Razzaque and Stockmann, 2016).
29 Compassion, while part of an OD philosophy, is not explicitly a
30 measured outcome. In recovery philosophy, peer support workers also
31 use compassion as part of their toolbox (Horsfall et al. 2019; Weir et al,
32 2019), seeking trouble peoples' strengths, however, there are no
33 published RCTs of the use of compassion by peer support workers.
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41

42 Self-compassion is also emerging in the literature as an important
43 means of gaining resilience against experiencing troubles (Trompetter et
44 al., 2017).
45
46

47 The evidence to date mostly relies on differences between an
48 intervention, and leaving people on waiting lists; outcomes from
49 questionnaires using numbers generated from maybe imprecise Likert
50 scales to infer causality, though maybe overly relying on statistical
51 significances, and thematic analysis of troubled peoples' views, be they
52 mental healthcare staff, SUACs and people drawn from general
53 populations. Given these limitations what is clear is that the human
54 psyche needs to be provided with compassion: by work colleagues, and
55 organisational systems of statutory care. Then SUACs, their families,
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 friends and professional allies will experience the compassion they need
4 to facilitate recovery. Across the world there is growing impetus, and
5 funds being made available to study compassion science and
6 disseminate gains in wellbeing of all through implementing
7 compassionate mental health.
8
9

10 11 **Implications for practice**

12
13 Self-compassion and care will dispel troubles within our circle of control.
14 For things we cannot control, then statutory mental health services need
15 to ensure their staff undergo mandatory training in all aspects of
16 compassionate mental health, including self-compassion, regular
17 assessments of their personal compassion indicators together with
18 supervision. It is clear from the current evidence base that whole mental
19 health systems will benefit. SUACs need to have compassionate mental
20 health care made available as alternatives to biomedical pharmacology.
21
22
23
24

25 26 **Future directions**

27
28 Until funding is made available by such organisations as, for example, in
29 UK, NIMHR to undertake RCTs around the efficacy of compassionate
30 mental health approaches compared with a biomedical model, then it will
31 remain under-represented in any meaningful way in the literature.
32
33

34 35 **References**

36
37 Abrahams, N. and Gevers, A. (2017), "A rapid appraisal of the status of
38 mental health support in post-rape care services in the Western Cape",
39 *South African Journal of Psychiatry*, Vol. 23, a959.

40
41 doi.org/10.4102/sajpsychiatry.v23i0.959

42
43 Adamson, E. and Dewer, B. (2015), "Compassionate care: student
44 nurses' learning through reflection and the use of story", *Nurse*
45 *Education in Practice*, Vol.15 No.3, pp.155-161.

46
47 doi.org/10.1016/j.nepr.2014.08.002

48
49
50 Allen, C. (2007), "Mental health services in England: reflections on the
51 Blair legacy", *Mental Health Practice*, Vol. 11 No.1, pp. 32-33.

52
53
54 Barron, K., Deery, R. and Sloan, G. (2017), "Community mental health
55 nurses' and compassion: an interpretative approach", *Journal of*
56 *Psychiatric and Mental Health Nursing*, Vol. 24, No. 4, 211–220. doi:
57 10.1111/jpm.12379
58
59
60

Berryhill, M. B., Harless, C. and Kean, P. (2018), "College student cohesive-flexible family functioning and mental health: examining gender differences and the mediation effects of positive family communication and self-compassion", *Counseling and Therapy for Couples and Families*, Vol. 26 No. 4, pp. 422-432.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/1066480718807411>

Brown, B., Crawford, P., Gilbert, J. and Gale, C. (2014), "Practical compassions: repertoires of practice and compassion talk in acute mental healthcare", *Sociology of Health and Illness*, Vol. 36 No. 3, pp. 383–399 doi: 10.1111/1467-9566.12065

Cetrano, C., Tedeschi, F., Rabbi, L., Gosetti, G., Lora, A., Lamonaca, D., Manthorpe, J. and Amaddeo, F. (2017), "How are compassion fatigue, burnout, and compassion satisfaction affected by quality of working life? Findings from a survey of mental health staff in Italy", *BMC Health Services Research*, Vol. 17 No. 755, pp.11 doi: 10.1186/s12913-017-2726-x

Chu, L. C. (2017), "Impact of providing compassion on job performance and mental health: the moderating effect of interpersonal relationship quality", *Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, Vol. 49 No. 4, pp. 456–465. doi: 10.1111/jnu.12307

Cogan, N., Burge, R. Wall, A.M., Barry, L. Tanner, G. and Ross, M. (2017), "The mindful path to compassion in an adult mental health group", *Clinical Psychology Forum*, Vol. 291, pp. 8-14.

Compassionate Mental Health (2020)

<http://www.compassionatementalhealth.co.uk> (accessed 09 May 2020).

Crawford, P., Gilbert, P., Gilbert, J., Gale, C. and Harvey, K. (2013), "The language of compassion in acute mental health care", *Qualitative Health Research*, Vol. 23 No. 6, pp. 719–727. doi: 10.1177/1049732313482190

Dewar, B. Adamson, E., Smith, S., Surfleet, J. and King, L. (2014), "Clarifying misconceptions about compassionate care", *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, Vol. 70 No. 8, pp.1738–1747. doi: 10.1111/jan.12322

Department of Health (2012), "Developing the culture of compassionate care: creating a new vision and strategy for nurses, midwives and care givers", available at:

www.wp.dh.gov.uk/commissioningboard/files/2012/10/nursing-vision.pdf.

(accessed 20th November, 2019)

Department of Health UK (2015), "The NHS constitution: The NHS belongs to us all",

file:///C:/Users/Owner/Documents/1%20University%20of%20Worcester%202008-/UoW/2019%20compassionate%20mental%20health/writing/NHS_Constitution_WEB.pdf (accessed 20th November 2019)

Donald, G., Wilson, I., McCarthy, J., Hall, I., Crossley, B., Adshead, P., Shaw, V., Dunne, R. and Dwyer, T. (2019), "Professional experiences of nurses and other health workers participating in a reflective course on compassion-based care." *British Journal of Nursing*, Vol. 28 No. 15, pp. xxx-xxx. doi.org/10.12968/bjon.2019.28.15.1020

Ferrari, M., Hunt, C., Harrysunker, A., Abbott, M.J., Beath, A.P. and Einstein, D.A. (2019), "Self-compassion interventions and psychosocial outcomes: a meta-analysis of RCTs", *Mindfulness*, Vol.10, pp.1455–1473. doi.org/10.1007/s12671-019-01134-6

Figley, C. R. (Ed. 1995), *Compassion fatigue: Coping with secondary traumatic stress disorder in those who treat the traumatized*, Brunner/Mazel, New York.

Firth-Cozens, J. and Cornwell, J. (2009), "The point of care: enabling compassionate care in acute hospital settings", The Kings Fund, London www.kingsfund.org.uk/sites/files/kf/field/field_publication_file/poc-enabling-compassionate-care-hospital-settings-apr09.pdf (accessed 20th November, 2019).

Forkus, S.R., Breines, J.G. and Weiss, N.H. (2019), "Morally injurious experiences and mental health: the moderating role of self-compassion", *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice, and Policy*, Vol. 11 No. 6, pp. 630 – 638. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/tra000044>

Frostadottir, A.D. and Dorjee, D. (2019), "Effects of mindfulness based cognitive therapy (MBCT) and compassion focused therapy (CFT) on symptom change, mindfulness, self-compassion, and rumination in clients with depression, anxiety, and stress", *Frontiers in Psychology*, Vol. 10 No. 17, 1099 doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.01099

Gaiswinkler, L., Kaufmann, P., Pollheimer, E., Ackermann, A., Holasek, S., Kapfhammer, H.P. and Unterrainer, H.F. (2019), "Mindfulness and

1
2
3 self-compassion in clinical psychiatric rehabilitation: a clinical trial”,
4 *Mindfulness*, Vol. 11, pp. 374–383. doi.org/10.1007/s12671-019-01171-1

6
7 Gilbert, P. and Procter, S. (2006), “Compassionate mind training for
8 people with high shame and self-criticism: overview and pilot study of a
9 group therapy approach”, *Clinical Psychology and Psychotherapy*, Vol.
10 13 No. 6, pp 353–79. doi.org/10.1002/cpp.507

12
13 Gilbert, P. (2010), *Compassion Focused Therapy: The CBT Distinctive*
14 *Features Series*. Routledge, London.

16
17 Horsfall, D., Paton, J. and Carrington, A. (2018), “Experiencing recovery:
18 findings from a qualitative study into mental illness, self and place”,
19 *Journal of Mental Health*, Vol. 27 No. 4, pp. 307-313. doi:
20 10.1080/09638237.2017.1385736

22
23 Inwood, E. and Ferrari, M. (2018), “mechanisms of change in the
24 relationship between self-compassion, emotion regulation, and mental
25 health: a systematic review”, *Applied Psychology: Health And Well-*
26 *Being*, Vol. 10 No 2, pp. 215–235. doi:10.1111/aphw.12127

28
29 Iwasaki, Y. and Byrd, N. G. (2010), “Cultural activities, identities, and
30 mental health among urban American Indians with mixed racial/ethnic
31 ancestries”, *Race Society Problems*, Vol. 2, pp.101–114. doi
32 10.1007/s12552-010-9028-9

34
35 Johnstone, L. (2019), Do you still need your psychiatric diagnosis?
36 Critiques and alternatives”. In Watson, J. (Ed.) *Drop the disorder!:*
37 *Challenging the culture of psychiatric diagnoses*. PCCS Books Ltd.:
38 Monmouth. pp. 8-23.

40
41 Johnstone, L. and Boyle, M., with Cromby, J., Dillon, J., Harper, D.,
42 Kinderman, P., Longden, E., Pilgrim, D. and Read, J. (2018), *The power*
43 *threat meaning framework: towards the identification of patterns in*
44 *emotional distress, unusual experiences and troubled or troubling*
45 *behaviour, as an alternative to functional psychiatric diagnosis*. British
46 Psychological Society, Leicester

48
49 Kiley, K.A., Sehgal, A.R., Neth, S., Dolata, J., Pike, E., Spilsbury, J.C.,
50 and Albert, J. M. (2018), “The effectiveness of guided imagery in treating
51 compassion fatigue and anxiety of mental health workers”, *Social Work*
52 *Research*, Vol. 42 No. 1, pp. 33-43. doi.org/10.1093/swr/svx026

54
55 Kirby, J., Tellegen, C.L. and Steindl, S. R. (2017), “A meta-analysis of
56 compassion-based interventions: current state of knowledge and future
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 directions”, *Behavior Therapy*, Vol. 48 No.6, pp. 778-792.
4 doi.org/10.1016/j.beth.2017.06.003
5

6
7 Kirby, J.N. and Gilbert, P. (2019), “Commentary regarding Wilson et al.
8 (2018) “Effectiveness of ‘self-compassion’ related therapies: a
9 systematic review and meta-analysis.” all is not as it seems”,
10 *Mindfulness*, Vol. 10 No. pp. 1006–1016. [doi.org/10.1007/s12671-018-](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12671-018-1088-8)
11 [1088-8](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12671-018-1088-8)
12

13
14 Kim, C. and Ho, H. (2018), “The impact of self-compassion on mental
15 health, sleep, quality of life and life satisfaction among older adults”,
16 *Geriatric Nursing*, Vol. 39 No.6, pp. 623-628.
17 doi.org/10.1016/j.gerinurse.2018.06.005
18

19
20 Kotera, Y., Green, P. and Sheffield D. (2019), “Mental health attitudes,
21 self-criticism, compassion and role identity among uk social work
22 students”, *British Journal of Social Work*, Vol. 49 No. 2, pp. 351–370.
23 doi: 10.1093/bjsw/bcy072
24

25
26 Lombas, A.S. (2019), “A review of the effect of compassion on mental
27 health: emotion regulation as a possible mechanism of action”, *RIECS*,
28 Vol. 4, No. S1 pp. 39-46. doi.org/10.37536/RIECS.2019.4.S1
29

30
31 La Mott, J. and Martin, L. A. (2019), “Adverse childhood experiences,
32 self-care, and compassion outcomes in mental health providers working
33 with trauma”, *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, Vol. 75 No. 6, pp. 1066–
34 1083. doi: 10.1002/jclp.22752
35

36
37 Lloyd, M. and Carson, A. (2011), “Making compassion count: equal
38 recognition and authentic involvement in mental health,” *International*
39 *Journal of Consumer Studies*, Vol. 35 No. 6, pp. 616-621.
40 doi:10.1111/j.1470-6431.2011.01018.x
41

42
43 MacBeth, A., and Gumley, A. (2012), “Exploring compassion: a
44 metaanalysis of the association between self-compassion and
45 psychopathology”, *Clinical Psychology Review*, Vol. 32 No. 6 pp. 545–
46 552. doi. org/10.1016/j.cpr.2012.06.003
47

48
49 Menzies, R. J., Reaume, G., LeFrançois, B.A. (2013), *Mad matters: a*
50 *critical reader in Canadian mad studies*. Canadian Scholars' Press Inc.,
51 Toronto.
52

53
54 McAndrew, S., Warne, T., Beaumont, E. and Hickey, A. (2017),
55 “MINDing the gap: service users’ perspectives of the differences in
56 mental health care between statutory and non-statutory organisations”,
57
58
59
60

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60

in 25th European Congress of Psychiatry / European Psychiatry. S304 available at: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eurpsy.2017.02.299> (accessed 20th November 2010)

Neff, K. D. (2003), "Self-compassion: An alternative conceptualization of a healthy attitude toward oneself" *Self and Identity*, Vol. 2 No. 2, pp. 85–101.

Parish, C. (2005), "Changes to mental health bill not radical enough, say campaigners", *Nursing Standard*, Vol.19 No. 45, pp. 7.

Post, S. G., Ng, L. E., Fischel, J. E., Bennett, M., Bily, L., Chandran, L., Joyce, J., Locicero, B., McGovern, K., McKeefrey, R. L., Rodriquez, J. V. and Roess, M.W. (2014), "Routine, empathic and compassionate patient care: definitions, development, obstacles, education and beneficiaries", *Journal of Evaluation in Clinical Practice*, Vol. 20 No.6, pp. 872–880. doi:10.1111/jep.12243

Radey, M. and Figley, C. R. (2007), "The social psychology of compassion", *Journal of Clinical Social Work*, Vol. 35, pp.207–214. doi 10.1007/s10615-007-0087-3

Ray, S., Wong, C., White, D. and Heaslip, K. (2013), "Compassion satisfaction, compassion fatigue, work life conditions, and burnout among frontline mental health care professionals", *Traumatology*, Vol. 19 No. 4, pp. 255–267. doi: 10.1177/1534765612471144

Razzaque, R. and Stockmann, T. (2016), "An introduction to peer supported open dialogue in mental healthcare", *British Journal of Psychiatry Advances*, Vol. 22 No. 5, pp. 348-356. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1192/apt.bp.115.015230>

Rossi, A., Cetrano, G., Pertile, R., Rabbi, L., Donisi, V., Grigoletti, L., Curtolo, C., Tansella, M., Thornicroft, G. and Amaddeo, F. (2012), "Burnout, compassion fatigue, and compassion satisfaction among staff in community-based mental health services" *Psychiatry Research*, Vol. 200 No. 2-3, pp.933–938. doi.org/10.1016/j.psychres.2012.07.029

Russo, J. and Sweeney, A. (2016), *Searching for a Rose Garden: Challenging Psychiatry, Fostering Mad Studies*. PCCS Books Ltd., Monmouth.

Samios, C. (2018), "Burnout and psychological adjustment in mental health workers in rural Australia: the roles of mindfulness and

1
2
3 compassion satisfaction”, *Mindfulness*, Vol. 9, pp. 1088–1099.
4 doi.org/10.1007/s12671-017-0844-5

5
6
7 Shea, S., Lionis, C. (2010), “Restoring humanity in health care through
8 the art of compassion: an issue for the teaching and research agenda in
9 rural health care”, *Rural Remote Health*, Vol. 10 No. 4, 1679.
10 <http://www.rrh.org.au>

11
12
13 Shea, S. and Lionis, C. (2017), “The call for compassion in healthcare”,
14 Seppälä, E. M., Simon-Thomas, E., Brown, S. L., Worline, M. C.,
15 Cameron, C. D. and Doty, J. R. (Eds.). *The Oxford Handbook of*
16 *Compassion Science*, Oxford University Press, USA.

17
18
19 Sommers-Spijkerman, M.P.J., Trompetter, H.R., Schreurs, K.M.G. and
20 Bohlmeijer, E. T. (2018), “Compassion-focused therapy as guided self-
21 help for enhancing public mental health: a randomized controlled trial”,
22 *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, Vol. 86 No. 2, pp. 101–
23 115. doi.org/10.1037/ccp0000268

24
25
26 Spandler, H. and Stickley, T. (2011), “No hope without compassion: the
27 importance of compassion in recovery-focused mental health services”,
28 *Journal of Mental Health*, Vol. 20 No. 6, pp.555–566. doi:
29 10.3109/09638237.2011.583949

30
31
32 Spandler, H. and Poursanidou, D. (2019), “Who is included in the Mad
33 Studies Project?” *The Journal of Ethics in Mental Health*, Vol. 10 No. 3
34 pp. 1-20 ISSN 1916-2405

35
36
37 The King’s Fund (2012), “Developing the culture of compassionate care:
38 Creating a new vision and strategy for nurses, midwives and care-
39 givers”, [https://www.kingsfund.org.uk/blog/2012/10/developing-culture-](https://www.kingsfund.org.uk/blog/2012/10/developing-culture-compassionate-care)
40 [compassionate-care](https://www.kingsfund.org.uk/blog/2012/10/developing-culture-compassionate-care) (accessed 20th November, 2019)

41
42
43 The NHS Confederation (2007), *Time and Trouble: Towards Proper and*
44 *Compassionate Mental Health Care*. The NHS Confederation, London.

45
46
47 Thompson, I., Amatea, E. and Thompson, E. (2014), “Personal and
48 contextual predictors of mental health counselors’ compassion fatigue
49 and burnout,” *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, Vol. 36 No.1, pp.
50 58–77. doi.org/10.17744/mehc.36.1.p61m73373m4617r3

51
52
53 Trompetter, H. R., de Kleine, E. and Bohlmeijer, E.T. (2017), “Why does
54 positive mental health buffer against psychopathology? An exploratory
55 study on self-compassion as a resilience mechanism and adaptive
56
57
58
59
60

1
2
3 emotion regulation strategy”, *Cognitive Therapy and Research*, Vol 41,
4 pp. 459–468. doi: 10.1007/s10608-016-9774-0

6
7 Turgoose, D. and Maddox, L. (2017), “Predictors of compassion fatigue
8 in mental health professionals: a narrative review”, *Traumatology* Vol. 23
9 No. 2, pp. 172–185. doi.org/10.1037/trm0000116

11
12 Valera, F.J. (1992), *Ethical Know-how: Action, Wisdom and Cognition*,
13 Stanford University Press, Stanford, pp. 73.

15
16 Varghese, B. (2020), “Relationships between positive and negative
17 attributes of self-compassion and perceived caring efficacy among
18 psychiatric–mental health nurses. *Journal of Psychosocial Nursing and*
19 *Mental Health Services*, Vol. 58 No. 2, pp. 32-40
20 doi.org/10.3928/02793695-20191022-01

23
24 Weir, B., Cunningham, M., Abraham, L. and Allanson-Oddy, C. (2019),
25 “Military veteran engagement with mental health and well-being
26 services: a qualitative study of the role of the peer support worker”,
27 *Journal of Mental Health*, Vol. 28 No. 6, pp. 647-653.
28 doi.org/10.1080/09638237.2017.1370640

30
31 Whitaker, R. (2010), *Anatomy of an epidemic: Magic Bullets, Psychiatric*
32 *Drugs, and the Astonishing Rise of Mental Illness in America*, Crown
33 Publishers, New York

35
36 Wilson, A. C., Mackintosh, K., Power, K. and Chan, S.W.Y. (2018),
37 “Effectiveness of self-compassion related therapies: a systematic review
38 and meta-analysis”, *Mindfulness*, Vol. 10, pp. 979–995.
39 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12671-018-1037-6>

41
42 Yakin, D., Gençöz, D., Steenbergen, L. and Arntz, A. (2019), “An
43 integrative perspective on the interplay between early maladaptive
44 schemas and mental health: the role of self-compassion and emotion
45 regulation,” *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, Vol. 75 No. 6, pp. 1098–
46 1113. doi: 10.1002/jclp.22755

47
48 Ying, Y.W. (2009), “Contribution of self-compassion to competence and
49 mental health in social work students” *Journal of Social Work Education*,
50 Vol. 45 No. 2, pp. 309-323. doi.org/10.5175/JSWE.2009.200700072

51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60