Leadership and Management Conference

University of Worcester

Tuesday 19th May 2009

“The appropriation of theories, ideas, concepts and models by management practitioners”.

Laurie Robinson, Dr. Catharine Ross & Dr. Jan Francis-Smythe
Definitions

Management: ‘Leading and directing an organization’ and ‘getting things done through people’.

Appropriation: ‘Incorporation within a governing framework’ in a ‘stable, assured and comfortable’ way.
Theoretical Insights

✓ Diffusion of innovations
  (Rogers)

✓ Fashion Theory
  (Abrahamson)

✓ Adult Learning
  (Kofka; Schultz; Dewey; Mezirow)
Methodology

- Overarching research philosophy of realism
- Qualitative data
- Inductive reasoning
- Case study strategy
- Data analysis process Eisenhardt
- Critical incident narrative

Initial Data Set

✓ Semi-structured, face to face & telephone, recorded interviews.

✓ 24 senior managers, five organisations, all economic sectors; 15 part time MBA participants.

✓ Verbatim transcripts, 160 critical incidents, 355,000 words, 34 hours 53 minutes in total.
Key Findings

× No obvious, direct, conscious usage of formal theory in decision making.

× No classical, decision tree, decision making.

× No predictive utilisation of formal theory.

✓ Retrospective confirmation of pre-existing practices.
Key Findings

✓ Strong evidence of recognition based decision – taking.

Described as experience, instinct, experiential, common sense, subconscious, intuitive, informal, reactive, immediate and practical etc.
Key Findings

✓ Strong evidence of emergent decision – building.

Described as gradual, evolving, discovering, emergent and considered etc.

Using both self sufficient and collaborative processes.
Key Findings

✅ Self sufficient processes included:
(i) unstructured, slightly chaotic personal reflection;
(ii) deconstruction and reconstruction
(iii) strong personal values
(iv) a willingness to utilise trial and error
(v) a willingness to take incremental steps.
Key Findings

✓ Collaboration involved: (i) peers, subordinates, bosses, former colleagues, established mentors, and role models; (ii) organisationally appointed facilitators and as a last resort (iii) paid consultants with a proven track record as a recent practitioner.
The exceptions were:
(i) where barriers prevented collaboration;
(ii) the coincidental attendance at an event
(iii) metaphorical usage to describe the future
and (iv) those whose role was to facilitate changes in managerial approach.
The Guru’s

Charles Handy
Meredith Belbin
Jim Kouzes
Barry Posner

Ken Blanchard
Paul Hersey
Katharine Cook Briggs
Isabel Briggs Myers

University of Worcester
Centre for People @ Work
www.worcester.ac.uk/cpaw
The Theories

**Myers Briggs type indicator**
(Myers Briggs)

**Belbin Team Roles**
(Belbin)

**Situational Leadership**
(Hersey & Blanchard)

**Team Development Stages**
(Tuckman)
The ‘Missing’ Guru’s

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>John Adair</th>
<th>Henri Fayol</th>
<th>Douglas McGregor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chris Argyris</td>
<td>Gary Hammel</td>
<td>Abraham Maslow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warren Bennis</td>
<td>Michael Hammer</td>
<td>Henry Mintzberg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Champy</td>
<td>Frederick Herzberg</td>
<td>Tom Peters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alfred Chandler</td>
<td>Elton Mayo</td>
<td>Robert Waterman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phillip Crosby</td>
<td>Joseph Juran</td>
<td>Michael Porter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edwards Deming</td>
<td>Rosabeth Moss Kanter</td>
<td>Reg Revans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Drucker</td>
<td>Robert Kaplan</td>
<td>Edgar Schein</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>John Kotter</td>
<td>Peter Senge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>David Norton</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

University of Worcester
Centre for People @ Work

www.worcester.ac.uk/cpaw
The assertion of practitioners that they ‘must be’ drawing upon the more formal, more academic ideas, theories, concepts and models in some kind of subtle, indirect, subconscious, or even subliminal way.
The Possibilities

1. That appropriation is a genuinely rare and wholly exceptional occurrence.

2. That appropriation is a more frequent, but wholly tacit phenomenon.

3. That appropriation is explicit, but that the knowledge becomes tacit over time.
An Alpine Story
Thanks!